Case 3:22-cv-04792-RS Document 47 Filed 03/15/23 Page 1 of 19

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Michael W. Sobol (SBN 194857) msobol@lchb.com David T. Rudolph (SBN 233457) drudolph@lchb.com Jallé H. Dafa (SBN 290637) jdafa@lchb.com LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN & BERNSTEIN, LLP 275 Battery Street, 29th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone: 415.956.1000 Facsimile: 415.956.1008 Attorney for Plaintiffs and the Class	
9	UNITED STATE	ES DISTRICT COURT
10	NORTHERN DIST	TRICT OF CALIFORNIA
11	SAN FRANC	CISCO DIVISION
12		
13	Michael Katz-Lacabe, et al.,	Case No. 3:22-cv-04792-RS
14 15	Plaintiffs, vs.	[STIPULATED] ORDER RE: DISCOVERY OF ELECTRONICALLY STORED INFORMATION
16	ORACLE AMERICA, INC., a corporation	
17	organized under the laws of the State of	Judge: Hon. Richard Seeborg
18	Delaware,	Date Action Filed: August 19, 2022 Trial Date: Not set
19	Defendant.	
20		J
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
		IGTIDIU ATEDI ODDED DE DIGGOVEDVO

[STIPULATED] ORDER RE: DISCOVERY OF ELECTRONICALLY STORED INFORMATION CASE NO. 3:22-CV-04792-RS

I. <u>PURPOSE</u>

This Order will govern discovery of electronically stored information ("ESI") in this case as a supplement to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, this Court's Guidelines for the Discovery of Electronically Stored Information, and any other applicable orders and rules.

II. COOPERATION

The parties are aware of the importance the Court places on cooperation and commit to cooperate in good faith throughout the matter consistent with this Court's Guidelines for the Discovery of ESI.

III. PROPORTIONALITY

The parties are expected to use reasonable, good faith, and proportional efforts to preserve, identify, and produce relevant information consistent with Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(1).

IV. LIAISON

- 1. The parties have identified liaisons to each other who are and will be knowledgeable about and responsible for discussing their respective ESI. Each e-discovery liaison will be, or have access to those who are, knowledgeable about the technical aspects of e-discovery, including the location, nature, accessibility, format, collection, search methodologies, and production of ESI in this matter. The parties will rely on the liaisons, as needed, to confer about ESI and to help resolve disputes without court intervention.
- 2. Oracle America, Inc. appoints Whitney O'Byrne, Danielle Vallone, and Erik Manukyan (Morrison & Foerster LLP) as its e-discovery liaisons.
- 3. Plaintiffs appoint David Rudolph and Jallé Dafa (Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, LLP) as their e-discovery liaisons.

V. PRESERVATION

The parties have discussed their preservation obligations and agree that preservation of potentially relevant ESI will be reasonable and proportionate. To reduce the costs and burdens of preservation and to ensure proper ESI is preserved, the parties agree that:

[STIPULATED] ORDER RE: DISCOVERY OF ELECTRONICALLY STORED INFORMATION CASE NO. 3:22-CV-04792-RS

¹ Information can originate in any form, including ESI and paper, and is not limited to information created or stored electronically.

consumer information used by or associated with the ID Graph, ² BlueKai, Datalogix, ³ AddThis, ⁴ 1 the Oracle Core Tag,⁵ and Oracle Data Marketplace⁶; and 2 3 (d) All alterations or deletions of data made by Oracle to any ESI location, 4 device, or file indicating when the change was made, specifics of the content of the change, the 5 reason for the change, and who made the change. 6 VI. **SEARCH & REVIEW** 7 1. The parties understand and agree that discovery in this case shall encompass information related to the allegations in Plaintiffs' Complaint filed on August 19, 2022,7 including 8 9 but not limited to the following: 10 11 12 ² Oracle's "ID Graph" refers to the functionality which "connect[s] identities across disparate marketing channels and devices to one customer" and "seamlessly pulls together the many IDs 13 across marketing channels and devices that comprise a given person, enabling marketers to tie their interactions to an actionable customer profile" as described in Oracle's technical 14 documentation at ID Management, https://docs.oracle.com/en/cloud/saas/data-cloud/data-cloudhelpcenter/IntegratingBlueKaiPlatform/id_management.html [https://perma.cc/LCW9-9PCH]. 15 ³ "Datalogix" refers to the functionality and data which "provides marketers and publishers with a rich understanding of consumers across digital and offline channels based on what they do, what 16 they say, and what they buy," as described by Oracle at Datalogix by Oracle Data Cloud, https://partners.twitter.com/en/partners/datalogix-byoracle-data-cloud [https://perma.cc/N855-17 D5VV] and Using the Datalogix Profile Analysis Dashboard, Oracle, https://docs.oracle.com/en/cloud/saas/marketing/cx-audienceuser/ 18 AudienceInsight_DLXDashboard.htm#Using [https://perma.cc/G4DM-BWR8]. ⁴ "AddThis" refers to the tools, plugins, and functionality which are described in the *AddThis* 19 *Privacy Policy*, https://www.oracle.com/legal/privacy/addthis-privacy-policy.html. ⁵ Oracle's "bk-coretag.js functionality" is the functionality which "extract[s] online user attributes 20 and import[s] them into the Oracle Data Cloud platform" as described in Oracle's technical documentation at Oracle Data Cloud Core Tag Implementation, 21 https://docs.oracle.com/en/cloud/saas/datacloud/ data-cloud-helpcenter/IntegratingBlueKaiPlatform/DataIngest/coretag_implementation.html 22 [https://perma.cc/8XVU-8Z2F]. 23 ⁶ Oracle's "Data Marketplace" refers to "the world's largest third-party data marketplace" for "audience data trading" as described in Oracle's technical documentation at Oracle Data 24 Marketplace, https://docs.oracle.com/en/cloud/saas/data-cloud/data-cloudhelpcenter/AudienceDataMarketplace/AudienceDataMarketplace.html [https://perma.cc/27S8-25 GX7H]. ⁷ In agreeing that discovery may encompass these categories of information, the parties do not 26 concede the admissibility, relevancy, or existence of any documents or information potentially included in each category or of the subject matter to which the category refers. The parties do not 27 adopt or endorse the factual premise or predicate of any category. The parties preserve all rights to assert any applicable objection, privilege, or protection at an appropriate time. 28

1	(a) Oracle's collection, storage, use, and sale of the Personal Data ⁸ of the	
2	representative Plaintiffs and the members of the Classes ⁹ ;	
3	(b) Data, information, and documents related to the representative Plaintiffs or	
4	the members of the Classes, including but not limited to any Personal Data, and or data associated	
5	with their respective identifiers (including but not limited to email addresses, phone numbers,	
6	Oracle/Bluekai cookies, device identifiers IDFA/ADID/IMEI, and IP addresses);	
7	(c) "Aggregate consumer information" within the meaning of California Civil	
8	Code § 1798.140 except for such data that is associated solely with Oracle's Moat product.	
9	(d) Oracle's policies, security guidelines, operating procedures, and practices	
10	concerning its collection of Internet users' Personal Data;	
11	(e) Oracle's policies, security guidelines, operating procedures, and practices	
12	concerning the sale of Internet users' Personal Data;	
13	(f) Oracle's policies, security guidelines, operating procedures, and practices	
14	concerning the sharing of Personal Data, with third-party advertisers, researchers, government	
15	agencies, developers, and other customers;	
16	(g) Oracle's information system architecture depicting the collection, storage,	
17	use, and sale of Internet users' Personal Data;	
18	(h) ESI, including but not limited to ESI contained on Plaintiffs' physical	
19	devices related to the allegations in Plaintiffs' Complaint.	
20	(i) The parties continue to meet and confer regarding the relevance of source	
21	code and documentation related to Oracle's ID Graph, Data Marketplace, and Oracle's bk-	
22		
23		
24	8 The parties agree that "Personal Data" as used herein includes all "personal information" within	
25	the meaning of that term as set forth in California Civil Code § 1798.140, but without regard to whether or not such personal information is otherwise publicly available, and all "personal information" or "personal data" as those terms are defined in the Oracle Advertising Privacy Policy as of September 7, 2022, including both "Offline information" and "Online information"	
26		
27	as defined therein. 9 Plaintiffs' alleged definitions of the Class and its Subclasses are set forth in paragraphs 104-105	
28	of the Complaint (herein "the Classes").	

- 2. A party who intends to use search terms will describe a search protocol that will include: (a) the criteria to be used to identify the universe of documents to which search terms will be applied (e.g., date range), and (b) proposed search terms to be applied to that universe of documents, subject to revision based on, for example, meet and confer of the parties and the number of hits returned by each term. A requesting party may also suggest search terms to be applied. Any search protocol will include a requirement for the producing party to provide hit reports for proposed search terms before using the search terms to narrow the universe of documents to be searched. The parties agree to meet and confer regarding the search protocol and to raise any unresolved disputes to the Court for resolution.
 - 3. A party who intends to use TAR will describe a TAR protocol that will include:

 (a) the TAR system to be used; (b) the criteria to be used to identify the universe of documents to which TAR is to be applied (the "TAR Universe"); (c) its methodology for training the TAR model and identifying responsive documents; (d) the methodology for validation testing to be used; (e) the subject-matter expert who will oversee the implementation of the TAR protocol; and (f) the process by which; (f) the process by which documents excluded as not conducive to categorization (e.g., multimedia files, primarily numerical spreadsheets, database files) will be reviewed for production.

¹⁰ Oracle's "cookies" are any cookies which Oracle uses to inform its ID Graph and Data Marketplace with Internet user data, such as are described in the *Oracle Advertising Privacy Policy*, https://www.oracle.com/legal/privacy/advertising-privacy-policy.html [https://perma.cc/MP25- TAXY].

¹¹ Oracle's "tracking pixels" are 1x1-sized pixel image tags that point to endpoints on Oracle servers and which track website visit and email activity, such as are described in the *Oracle Advertising Privacy Policy*, https://www.oracle.com/legal/privacy/advertising-privacy-policy.html [https://perma.cc/MP25- TAXY].

¹² "Device identification" means the practice of tracking Internet users' online activities by collecting identifiers tied to their devices, such as is described in the *Oracle Advertising Privacy Policy*, https://www.oracle.com/legal/privacy/advertising-privacy-policy.html [https://perma.cc/MP25- TAXY].

¹³ "Cross-device tracking" refers to the practice of tracking Internet user's activities across multiple devices, as described in Oracle's technical documentation at *Creating Audiences*, Oracle, https://docs.oracle.com/en/cloud/saas/data-cloud/data-cloud-helpcenter/Platform/Audiences/create audience.html [https://perma.cc/K6F2-NPZF].

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 4. If a party is using culling technology, criteria or methods, the producing party agrees to disclose details in advance to the receiving party along with the sources across which it plans to apply the culling techniques. The parties must also provide written information regarding the use of any other advanced culling techniques they employ in connection with their culling of the documents if they are using such technology to exclude documents from manual review.
- 5. Each party will use its best efforts to filter out common system files and application executable files by using a commercially reasonable hash identification process. Hash values that may be filtered out during this process are located in the National Software Reference Library ("NSRL") NIST hash set list. Additional culling of file types based on file header information may include, but are not limited to: Application Package File, Backup Files, Batch Files, Binary Disc Image, C++ File Formats, Cascading Style Sheet, Configuration File, Dictionary Files, Dynamic Link Library, Event Log Files, Executable Files, Hypertext Cascading Stylesheet, Java Archive Files, JavaScript files, JavaScript Source Code and Class Files, Macintosh Resource Fork Files, Package Manager Files, Program Files, Program Installers, Python Script Files, Shell Script Files, System or Temporary Files, Thumbnail Cache Files, Troff Files, TrueType Font Files, Windows Cabinet File, Windows Command Files, Windows File Shortcut, Windows Help Files, Windows Metafiles and Enhanced Metafiles, Windows Spool Files, Windows System File. The parties shall meet and confer regarding whether Source code is relevant, and if so Source code files will be made available according to a separate protective order and not included in custodial data productions.
- 6. Deduplication. A party is required to produce only a single copy of a responsive document, and a party may de-duplicate responsive ESI across custodians at the family level using MD5 or SHA-1 hash.

VII. PRODUCTION FORMATS

The parties agree to produce documents in the formats described in Appendix 1 to this Order. If particular documents warrant a different format, the parties will cooperate to arrange for the mutually acceptable production of such documents. The parties agree not to degrade the searchability of documents as part of the document production process.

VIII. PHASING

When a party propounds discovery requests pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 34, the parties agree to discuss phasing the production of ESI.

IX. <u>DOCUMENTS PROTECTED FROM DISCOVERY</u>

- 1. Pursuant to Federal Rule Evidence 502(d), the production of a privileged or work product-protected document ("Protected Information"), whether inadvertent or otherwise, is not a waiver of privilege or protection from discovery in this case or in any other federal or state proceeding. For example, the mere production of privileged or work-product-protected documents in this case as part of a mass production is not itself a waiver in this case or in any other federal or state proceeding.
- 2. Communications that post-date the filing of the Complaint need not be placed on a privilege log.
- 3. If the receiving party has reason to believe that a produced document or other information may reasonably be subject to a claim of privilege or protection, then the receiving party shall immediately sequester the document or information, cease using the document or information and cease using any work product containing the information, and shall inform the producing party of the beginning Bates number of the document or, if no Bates number is available, shall otherwise inform the producing party of the information.
- 4. A producing party must give written notice to any receiving party asserting a claim of privilege, work-product protection, or other ground for reclaiming documents or information inadvertently produced (a "clawback request"). After a clawback request is received, the receiving party shall immediately sequester the document (if not already sequestered) and shall not review or use that document, or any work product containing information taken from that document, for any purpose.

X. <u>MODIFICATION</u>

If necessary, the ESI Protocol may be amended by written modification of all parties and approval by the Court.

1	IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUG	GH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
2		
3	Dated: March 15, 2023	Respectfully Submitted,
4		/s/ David T. Rudolph
5		Michael W. Sobol (SBN 194857) msobol@lchb.com
6		David T. Rudolph (SBN 233457) drudolph@lchb.com
7		Jallé H. Dafa (SBN 290637) jdafa@lchb.com
8		LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN & BERNSTEIN, LLP 275 Battery Street, 29th Floor
9		San Francisco, CA 94111-3339 Telephone: 415.956.1000
10		Facsimile: 415.956.1008
11		Attorneys for Plaintiffs and the Class
12	Dated: March 15, 2023	/s/ Whitney O'Byrne
13		Tiffany Cheung (SBN 211497)
14		TCheung@mofo.com Danielle Vallone (SBN 302497)
15		DVallone@mofo.com MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP
16		425 Market Street San Francisco, California 94105
17		Telephone: 415.268.7000 Facsimile: 415.268.7522
18		Purvi G. Patel (SBN 270702)
19		PPatel@mofo.com Whitney O'Byrne (SBN 325698)
20		WOByrne@mofo.com Erik Manukyan (SBN 340307)
21		EManukyan@mofo.com Emma Burgoon (SBN 348097)
22		EBurgoon@mofo.com MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP
23		707 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 6000 Los Angeles, California 90017
24		Telephone: 213.892.5200 Facsimile: 213.892.5454
25		Attorneys for Oracle America, Inc.
26		
27		
28		

Case 3:22-cv-04792-RS Document 47 Filed 03/15/23 Page 10 of 19

1	ATTESTATION
2	Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5.1 regarding signatures, I attest that concurrence in the
3	filing of this document has been obtained from the other signatories.
4	
5	Dated: March 15, 2023 /s/ David T. Rudolph
6	David T. Rudolph
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

Case 3:22-cv-04792-RS Document 47 Filed 03/15/23 Page 11 of 19

1	IT IS ORDERED that the foregoing Agreement is approved.
2	D. c. l.
3	Dated: Honorable Richard Seeborg United State District Judge
4	United State District Judge
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

APPENDIX 1 PRODUCTION FORMAT AND METADATA

- 1. **Production Components**. Productions shall include, single page TIFFs, Text Files, an ASCII delimited metadata file (.dat file) and an image load file that can be loaded into commercially acceptable production software (e.g., Relativity).
- 2. **Image Load File.** Image load file must be in standard Option (.OPT) format and must reference each TIFF file in the corresponding production, and the total number of TIFF files referenced in the load file must match the total number of image files in the production. The total number of Documents referenced in a production's data load file should match the total number of designated Document breaks in the corresponding image load file for that production. In any deliverable volume, documents should be organized in such a way that each folder in the volume contains 1000 files (each TIFF page or native file is a single file) as one file per folder. Every image in the delivery volume should be cross-referenced in the image load file. The imageID key should be named the same as the Bates number of the page. Load files should not span across media (e.g., CDs, DVDs, hard drives, etc.), i.e., a separate volume should be created for each piece of media delivered. Sample Concordance/Opticon Image (.OPT) Load File:
 - MSC000001, MSC001, \VOL001\IMAGES\001\MSC000001.TIF,Y,,,2
 - MSC000002, MSC001, \VOL001\IMAGES\001\MSC000002.TIF,...
 - MSC000004, MSC001, \VOL001\IMAGES\001\MSC000004.TIF,Y,,,2
 - MSC000005, MSC001, \VOL001\IMAGES\001\MSC000005.TIF.
- 3. **Metadata Fields and Metadata File**. Each of the metadata and coding fields set forth below that can be extracted shall be produced for each document. The parties are not obligated to populate manually any of the fields below if such fields cannot be extracted from a document, with the exception of the following: BEGBATES, ENDBATES, BEGATTACH, ENDATTACH, CUSTODIAN, NATIVELINK, TEXTLINK, HASH_VALUE, REDACTED, REDACTED_REASON, and CONFIDENTIALITY. The metadata file shall be delimited according to the following characters:
 - Delimiter = \P (ASCII:020)
 - Text-Qualifier = b (ASCII:254)

• Multi-value delimiter = (ASCII Code 059)

Field Name	Field Description
BegBates	First Bates number (production number) of an item
EndBates	Last Bates number (production number) of an item **The EndBates field should be populated for single-page items.
AttachName	File name of the attachment, with any attachments separated by semi-colon.
BegAttach/Group ID	First Bates number of family group.
EndAttach	Last Bates number of attachment range (<i>i.e.</i> , Bates number of the last page of the last attachment)
PgCount	Number of pages in the item
Custodian	Name of person or source from whose/which files the item is produced
AllCustodian	Name of the person(s), in addition to the Custodian, from whose files the item would have been produced if it had not been de- duplicated
FileSize	Size (in kilobytes) of the source native file
SourceFilePath ¹⁴	The directory structure or path where the original file was stored on the party's source computer system, ending in the filename. Any container name (such as ZIP or PST containers) is included in the path.
HashValue	The MD5 or SHA-1 or IntMsgID hash value of the item.
NativeFileLink	Relative path for documents provided in native format only. **The linked file must be named per the BegBates value.
SourceParty	Name of entity or party producing the item
RecordType	Indicates item type (e.g., email, edoc, attachment)
FileType	(e.g., Outlook, Adobe Acrobat, MS Word, etc.)

¹⁴ This field may be excluded if the producing party determines it includes information protected by any applicable privilege or immunity.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27
26
27

Field Name	Field Description
FileExtension	Indicates file extension of the file e.g., .docx, .pptx
Parent Date/Sort Date	The date associated with a family's parent record, which is assigned as follows:
	Emails populated with 1st occurrence: Date Sent or Date Received or Date Last Modified . Email attachments populated from the date above Outlook Appointments populated with 1st occurrence of Start Date or Date Last Modified
	Loose Edocs populated with 1 st occurrence of Date Last Modified or Date Created
DateSent (mm/dd/yyyy)	Date email or calendar item was sent
TimeSent (hh:mmAM/PM)	Time email or calendar item was sent (Date and time fields may be combined)
DateReceived	Date email or calendar item was received
TimeReceived	Time email or calendar item was received (Date and time fields may be combined)
То	The names and/or SMTP email addresses of all recipients that were included on the "To" line of the email or calendar item
From	The name and/or SMTP email address of the sender of the email or calendar item
CC	The names and/or SMTP email addresses of all recipients that were included on the "CC" line of the email or calendar item
BCC	The names and/or SMTP email addresses of all recipients that were included on the "BCC" line of the email or calendar item
Number of Attachments	Number of attached, embedded or grouped items
DateCreated (mm/dd/yyyy)	Date the item was created
TimeCreated (hh:mm AM/PM)	Time the item was created (Date and time fields may be combined)

Field Name	Field Description
ModifiedBy	Person who last modified or saved the item, as populated in the metadata or document properties of the native file
LastModDate (mm/dd/yyyy)	Date the item was last modified
LastModTime (hh:mm AM/PM)	Time the item was last modified
Date Last Printed	Date the document was last printed.
FileName	The filename of the source native file for an ESI item
Title	Any value populated in the Title field of the source file metadata or item properties
Subject/E-Mail Subject	Any value populated in the Subject field of the source file metadata or document properties (<i>e.g.</i> , subject line of email or calendar item)
Author	Creator of the document; any value populated in the Author field of the source file metadata or document properties
TextPath	Full relative path to the location of the document-level text file.
Redacted	User-generated field that will indicate redactions. With the word "REDACTED". Otherwise, blank.
Redaction Reason	The reason for the redaction. If more than one reason, separate by semi-colons.
Confidentiality	User-generated field that will indicate confidentiality. With the word "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" or "ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY" applicable. Otherwise, blank.

4. **TIFFs**. The parties agree that all Documents, with the exception of Documents produced in Native Format, will be produced as single-page black and white Group IV TIFF image files of at least 300 dpi resolution with 1 bit depth. Page size shall be 8.5 x 11 inches, unless in the reasonable judgment of the producing party, a particular item requires a different page size. Each image file will use the Bates number of the page as its unique file name. Original document

6

10

9

11

12

13 14

15

17

16

18 19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26

27

28

orientation as displayed in the native file should be maintained in the TIFF image (i.e., portrait to portrait and landscape to landscape). All hard copy Documents that are scanned will be produced in electronic form.

- 5. **Color Documents**. Where necessary and practicable, hard copy Documents in color will be scanned in color to ensure full information is communicated in the scanned copy. Scanned color documents will be provided in JPG file format. If an original ESI Document contains color text, markings or graphics, and the receiving party believes it is necessary to view such Document in its original color to understand its full meaning or content, then the receiving party may request that the ESI Document be produced in color format. The producing party shall then reproduce such Document(s) and/or ESI in color JPEG format, or in native format. This section also applies to documents that are produced as TIFF images.
- 6. **Text Files.** A single multi-page text file shall be provided for each document, and the filename should match its respective TIFF filename. A commercially acceptable technology for optical character recognition "OCR" shall be used for all scanned, hard copy documents. When possible, the text of native files should be extracted directly from the native file. Text files will not contain the redacted portions of the documents and OCR text files will be substituted instead of extracted text files for redacted documents. All documents shall be produced with a link in the TextLink field.
- 7. **Image Load Files / Data Load Files.** Each TIFF in a production must be referenced in the corresponding image load file. The total number of documents referenced in a production's data load file should match the total number of designated document breaks in the Image Load file(s) in the production. The total number of pages referenced in a production's image load file should match the total number of TIFF files in the production. The total number of documents in a production should match the total number of records in the data load file.
- 8. **Bates Numbering**. Each TIFF image produced under this Order shall be assigned a Bates number that must: (1) be unique across the entire document production; (2) maintain a constant length of nine numeric digits (including 0-padding) across the entire production; (3) contain only alphanumeric characters, no special characters or embedded spaces; and (4) be

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

- each production in a cover letter or production log accompanying the production. If a producing party skips a Bates number or set of Bates numbers in a production, the producing party will identify and note the gap in the cover letter or production log accompanying the production. The producing party will brand all TIFF images in the lower right-hand corner with its corresponding Bates number, using a consistent font type and size. If the receiving party believes that a Bates number obscures the content of a Document, then the receiving party may request that the
- **Redaction**. The parties agree that where ESI items need to be redacted, they shall be produced in TIFF format with each redaction clearly indicated or where TIFF format is not practicable, in redacted native format, as noted below. Any unaffected data fields shall be provided. The redaction of any material for privilege or other reason shall be governed by the applicable rules and case law regarding privilege and the provisions contained in the Protective Order entered in this action. Documents that are to be produced in native format, but that require redactions may be produced as TIFF images with the relevant portions redacted, or if a TIFF image production is not practicable (e.g., the file is a video or very large spreadsheet), the producing party may produce a copy of the native file with the relevant portions replaced with "REDACTED" or a similar mark. If modification of a native file is required for redaction purposes, metadata information associated with that file should remain unchanged, unless it also requires redaction. For each document that is redacted, a Redaction field will be populated with the word "REDACTED" in the .DAT file. Also, the producing party will keep a pristine original copy of the native document.
- 11. Printing Specifications for Excel and PowerPoint Files. For Excel and PowerPoint type files that are printed to TIFF for redaction and redacted, the following printing options shall be enabled:

1	Excel Print to TIFF Options
2	Unhide columns and rows
3	Unhide worksheets
4	Autofit columns and rows, settings to be over by columns first and, then down by
5	row
6	Print gridlines
7	Do not apply Autofilter
8	Display headings
9	Display comments
10	Header and Footer filename field handling: Show field code
11	12. Native Files . Spreadsheets (e.g., MS Excel, Oracle Sheets), PowerPoint files, and
12	delimited text files (e.g. comma-separated value (.csv) files and tab-separated value (.tsv) files)
13	shall be produced in either their native format or MS Excel, with applicable metadata and
14	extracted, searchable text. If good cause exists to request production of files, other than those
15	specifically set forth above, in native format, the party may request such production and provide
16	an explanation of the need for native file review, which request shall not unreasonably be denied.
17	Any native files that are produced shall be produced with a link in the NativeLink field, along with
18	extracted text and applicable metadata fields set forth in Appendix 1. A TIFF placeholder
19	indicating that the document was provided in native format should accompany the database record
20	If a file has been redacted, color TIFF images and OCR text of the redacted document will suffice
21	in lieu of a native file and extracted text.
22	13. Proprietary Files . To the extent a response to discovery requires production of
23	ESI accessible only through proprietary software, the parties should continue to preserve each
24	version of such information. The parties shall meet and confer to finalize the appropriate
25	production format.
26	14. Databases, Structured, Aggregated or Application Data . For requests in which
27	responsive information is contained in a database or other structured or aggregated data source, the
28	parties will meet and confer to identify a reasonable method and format for production.

Case 3:22-cv-04792-RS Document 47 Filed 03/15/23 Page 19 of 19

1	15. Production Media . Documents shall be encrypted and produced on an FTP link.
2	and shall identify a production number corresponding to the production volume (e.g., "VOL001,"
3	"VOL002"), as well as the volume of the material in that production (e.g. "-001," "-002"). Each
4	piece document shall also identify: (1) the producing party's name; (2) the production date; (3) the
5	Bates Number range; and (4) the set(s) of requests for production for which the documents are
6	being produced.
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	